



**Report of the  
Comptroller and Auditor General of India**

**Sharing of  
Revenue by Private Telecom Service Providers  
during the years 2006-07 to 2009-10**



**Union Government  
(Communications and IT Sector)**

**No. 4 of 2016**

**Report of the  
Comptroller and Auditor General  
of India**

**Sharing of  
Revenue by Private Telecom Service Providers  
during the years 2006-07 to 2009-10**

**Union Government  
(Communications and IT Sector)  
No. 4 of 2016**

## CONTENTS

Description	Paragraph	Page
Preface		xi
Executive Summary		xiii
<b>Chapter – I : Introduction</b>		
Genesis of revenue sharing regime in the Indian Telecom Sector	1.1	1
New Telecom Policy-1999	1.2	1
Unified Access Service Licence (UASL) and Unified Licences (UL)	1.3	2
Provisions in the Licence agreements on definition of Gross Revenue (GR)/Adjusted Gross Revenue (AGR)	1.4	2
Stipulations in UASL Agreements on reporting revenue and payment of LF	1.5	4
Rates of licence fee	1.6	6
Allocation of Spectrum and Spectrum Usage Charges	1.7	6
Revenue share collected by DoT	1.8	7
Arrangements in DoT for collection and accounting of licence fee and SUC	1.9	8
<b>Chapter – II : Audit Approach</b>		
Scope of Audit	2.1	9
Audit methodology	2.2	10
Audit criteria	2.3	11
Acknowledgement	2.4	11
<b>Chapter-III: Revenue shared by M/s Bharti Airtel Limited and M/s Bharti Hexacom Limited</b>		
Brief Profile of M/s Bharti Airtel Limited and M/s Bharti Hexacom Limited	3.1	13
Licenses granted to M/s Bharti Airtel Limited and M/s Bharti Hexacom Limited	3.1.1	13
Spectrum allotted to M/s BAL/BHL	3.1.2	14
Subscriber base of BAL/BHL	3.1.3	15
Gross Revenue, Deduction, Adjusted Gross Revenue reported and revenue share paid by BAL/BHL	3.1.4	15
Under reporting of revenue by BAL/BHL	3.2	15
Under reporting of revenue due to netting off of revenue pertaining to Commission/offers/discounts to dealers/subscribers for prepaid services	3.2.1	16
Under reporting of revenue due to netting off of discounts/waivers granted to post-paid subscribers	3.2.2	20

Description	Paragraph	Page
Under reporting of Roaming Revenue due to set off of Inter Operator traffic (IOT) Discounts paid/credited to other Operators	3.2.3	22
Under reporting of revenue from Infrastructure sharing with other telecom operators for GR/AGR by BAL/BHL	3.2.4	23
Under reporting of revenue from Forex gain for GR/AGR by BAL/BHL	3.2.5	25
Under reporting of revenue in the Statements of Revenue and LF (AGR Statements) though reported in the books of accounts	3.3	27
Non consideration of Interest Income for GR/AGR	3.3.1	27
BAL's interest free loan to subsidiary resulted in avoidance of payment of LF/SUC	3.3.2	29
Non consideration of Profit on sale of Investment for GR/AGR for payment of revenue Share by BAL	3.3.3	29
Different standards for payment of dividends	3.3.4	30
Non Consideration of revenue accounted under Global Operations (BILGO) for LF	3.3.5	30
Non Consideration of revenue of erstwhile SBEL	3.3.6	32
Non consideration of revenue accounted under Infrastructure Provider (IP)-1 service for computation of revenue share by BAL	3.3.7	33
Non consideration of miscellaneous income for AGR for computation of LF/SUC by BAL	3.3.8	34
Non consideration of Income from profit on sale of fixed assets for AGR for payment of revenue Share by M/s BAL	3.3.9	35
Short/ non-payment of revenue share due to other issues	3.4	36
Irregular Deduction of Bad debts written off from GR to arrive at AGR by BAL/BHL	3.4.1	36
PSTN Deduction claimed against Leased Line Charges in 2006-07	3.4.2	37
Non consideration of revenue from sale/lease of bandwidth charges for AGR for payment of SUC	3.4.3	37
Transfers of telecom infrastructure assets by BAL to its subsidiary (BIL) at NIL value	3.5	38
Interest on short/non-payment of LF and SUC	3.6	39
DoT's response to the audit observations	3.7	39
<b>Chapter – IV : Revenue shared by Vodafone India Limited</b>		
Brief Profile of M/s Vodafone India Ltd	4.1	43
Licenses held by Vodafone Group	4.1.1	43
Radio frequency spectrum held by M/s Vodafone	4.1.2	43
Subscriber base growth - 2006-07 to 2009-10	4.1.3	44

Description	Paragraph	Page
Financial data on GR/Deductions/AGR and revenue share paid by Vodafone India Limited	4.1.4	44
Audit verification of accounting and reporting of GR by Vodafone	4.2	44
Commission/discounts to dealers netted of from pre-paid and post-paid revenue	4.2.1	45
Airtime Discounts to customers	4.2.2	46
Roaming revenue understated due to netting of Inter Operator traffic (IOT) Discounts paid/credited to other Operators	4.2.3	46
Understatement of GR due to Service Tax being set off from revenue on schemes like 'Full Pe Full', 'Full Talk Time' etc.	4.2.4	47
Understatement of GR due to non-inclusion of revenue from Infrastructure sharing in full	4.2.5	48
Under reporting of revenue from FOREX gains for GR/AGR	4.2.6	49
Debits from revenue as Waiver- Goodwill waiver, rebates etc.	4.2.7	51
Other Income not included in Gross Revenue	4.3	51
Interest Income	4.3.1	52
Income received on profit of Sale of fixed assets not included in GR	4.3.2	52
Bad debts deducted from GR	4.4	53
Transfer of assets to subsidiary Company	4.5	54
Interest on revenue share short paid	4.6	54
DoT's response to the audit observations	4.7	55
<b>Chapter – V : Revenue shared by M/s Reliance Communications Limited and M/s Reliance Telecom Limited</b>		
Brief Profile of M/s Reliance Communications Limited (RCL) and Reliance Telecom Limited (RTL)	5.1	57
Licences granted to RCL and RTL	5.1.1	57
Spectrum allotted to RCL/RTL	5.1.2	57
Subscriber base of RCL/RTL	5.1.3	58
Gross Revenue (GR), Deduction, Adjusted Gross Revenue (AGR) reported and revenue share paid by RCL/RTL	5.1.4	58
Arrangement between RCL and its subsidiary RCIL for Value added Services, Selling/ Marketing and Billing	5.1.5	59
Under reporting of Gross Revenue in the books of accounts of RCL/RTL	5.2	60
Booking of Prepaid revenue net of Free Air Time/Commission by RCL/RTL	5.2.1	60
Booking of revenue by RCL net of commission given to its subsidiary (RCIL) and booking of revenue in the subsidiary (RCIL) books of accounts instead of RCL's accounts	5.2.2	61

Description	Paragraph	Page
Netting of commission from the revenue by RCL for computation of GR/AGR	5.2.3	68
Netting of revenue earned from channel partners/Franchisees from expenses for computation of GR/AGR by RCL	5.2.4	68
Netting of revenue by discount given to distributors/dealers/franchisees on sale on prepaid products for computation of GR/AGR by RTL	5.2.5	68
Non - inclusion of value of Free of Charge (FOC) recharge vouchers given to distributors for computation of GR/AGR by RTL	5.2.6	70
Under reporting of revenue in the Statements of Revenue and LF (AGR Statements) though reported in the books of accounts	5.3	71
Non consideration of forex gain in GR/AGR by RCL and RTL	5.3.1	71
Non consideration of Interest/Other income for computation of GR/AGR by RCL/RTL	5.3.2	72
Interest free loan to subsidiary by RCL resulted in avoidance of payment of LF/SUC	5.3.3	74
Netting off of loss on sale of investment and non - inclusion of balance profit on sale of investment for computation of GR/AGR by RTL	5.3.4	74
Different standards for payment of dividends – RCL	5.3.5	75
Revenue considered for Licence Fee but not considered for Spectrum Usage Charges (SUC)	5.4	75
Non consideration of revenue from sale/lease of bandwidth for computation of SUC	5.4.1	75
Non consideration of income from investment for computation of SUC	5.4.2	76
Transfer of infrastructure assets by RCL/RTL to its subsidiary Reliance Infratel Ltd (RITL)	5.5	77
Transfer of Optic Fibre Undertaking (OFU) by RCL to RITL	5.5.1	77
Transfer of passive infrastructure by RCL/RTL to its subsidiary (RITL) at “nil’ value	5.5.2	78
Non-consideration of Refund of Service Tax for GR during the year 2009-10	5.6	79
Interest on short/non - payment of LF and SUC	5.7	80
Reply from DoT on issues raised above	5.8	80
<b>Chapter – VI : Revenue shared by Idea Cellular Limited (ICL) and Aditya Birla Telecom Limited (ABTL)</b>		
Brief profile of the company	6.1	83
Licences granted to Idea Cellular Ltd (ICL) & Aditya Birla Telecom Ltd. (ABTL)	6.1.1	83
Spectrum allotted to ICL / ABTL	6.1.2	84

Description	Paragraph	Page
Subscriber base of ICL/ ABTL	6.1.3	84
Gross Revenue, Deduction and Adjusted Gross Revenue reported and revenue share paid by ICL/ ABTL	6.1.4	84
Under reporting of revenue by ICL/ ABTL	6.2	84
Under reporting of revenue due to netting off of revenue pertaining to Commission/offers/discounts to dealers/subscribers for prepaid services	6.2.1	85
Under reporting of revenue due to netting off of discounts granted to post-paid subscribers	6.2.2	88
Under reporting of Roaming Revenue due to set off of Inter Operator traffic discounts paid/credited to other Operators	6.2.3	89
Under reporting of revenue from Infrastructure sharing revenue from other telecom operators for GR/AGR by ICL/ABTL	6.2.4	90
Non consideration of revenue from Switch sharing between Idea (NLD) and Idea (LSAs) for GR/AGR	6.2.5	92
Non consideration of revenue by ICL from assets given on Indefeasible Right to Use (IRU) for GR/AGR	6.2.6	93
Under reporting of revenue from Forex gain (revenue) for GR/AGR by ICL/ ABTL	6.2.7	94
Under reporting of revenue in the Statements of Revenue and LF (AGR Statements) though reported in the books of accounts	6.3	95
Non consideration of Interest Income for GR/AGR by ICL/ ABTL	6.3.1	95
Non consideration of profit on sale of Investment for GR/AGR for payment of revenue Share by ICL/ ABTL	6.3.2	96
Non consideration of miscellaneous income for AGR for computation of LF/SUC by M/s ICL	6.3.3	98
Non consideration of Income from profit on sale of fixed assets for AGR for payment of revenue Share by ICL/ABTL	6.3.4	99
Short/ non-payment of revenue share due to other issues	6.4	100
Irregular Deduction of Bad debts written off from GR to arrive at AGR by ICL	6.4.1	100
Other issues	6.5	101
Transfer of infrastructure assets by Idea Cellular Ltd to its subsidiary at NIL consideration for ultimate transfer to a Joint Venture	6.5.1	101
Interest on short/non-payment of LF and SUC	6.6	102
DoT's response to the audit observations	6.7	102
<b>Chapter-VII: Revenue shared by Tata Teleservices Limited and Tata Teleservices (Maharashtra) Limited</b>		
Brief profile of the company	7.1	103
Licenses granted to TTSL and TTML	7.1.1	103

Description	Paragraph	Page
Spectrum allotted to TTSL and TTML	7.1.2	103
Subscriber base of TTSL and TTML	7.1.3	104
Gross Revenue, Deduction, Adjusted Gross Revenue reported and revenue share paid by TTSL and TTML	7.1.4	104
Under reporting of revenue by TTSL and TTML	7.2	104
Commission paid to Distributors/Franchisees/Agents/Dealers etc. debited from the Revenue in respect of TTSL	7.2.1	105
Revenue understated due to netting of discounts allowed to subscribers etc. by TTSL and TTML	7.2.2	105
Netting of adjustments offered to customers from the Gross Revenue in respect of TTSL and TTML	7.2.3	106
Netting of the revenue from Startup Kit, recharge vouchers etc. by TTSL and TTML	7.2.4	107
Non consideration of income received from infrastructure sharing in GR by TTSL	7.2.5	108
Non- inclusion of realized forex gain for computation of GR by TTSL and TTML	7.2.6	109
Under reporting of revenue in the Statements of Revenue and LF (AGR Statements) though reported in the books of accounts	7.3	110
Non consideration of interest income in GR/AGR by TTSL	7.3.1	110
Profit on sale of Investment not considered in GR/AGR	7.3.2	111
Non consideration of profit on sale of assets for GR/AGR	7.3.3	111
Short/ non-payment of revenue share due to other issues	7.4	112
Bad debts written off adjusted from the revenue by TTSL resulting in understatement of AGR	7.4.1	112
Lease line and Port Charges included in deductions claimed by TTSL and TTML resulting in understatement of AGR	7.4.2	112
Non consideration of revenue from sharing/leasing of infrastructure/ bandwidth links for payment of SUC by TTSL	7.4.3	113
Non-consideration of Rental Income	7.4.4	114
Interest on short/non-payment of LF and SUC	7.5	114
DoT's response to the audit observations	7.6	114
<b>Chapter-VIII: Revenue shared by Aircel Group (Dishnet Wireless Ltd, Aircel Ltd and Aircel Cellular Ltd)</b>		
Brief Profile of Aircel Group	8.1	115
Licenses granted to Aircel Group	8.1.1	115
Spectrum allotted to Aircel group of companies	8.1.2	115
Subscriber base of AL/ACL/DWL	8.1.3	116
Gross Revenue (GR), Adjusted Gross Revenue (AGR) and Revenue share paid by the Aircel Group	8.1.4	116



Description	Paragraph	Page
Under reporting of revenue by Aircel Group	8.2	116
Under reporting of Prepaid/Post-paid revenue due to netting off of revenue relating to various offers given to subscribers	8.2.1	116
Short accounting of revenue due to upfront debit in the revenue heads	8.2.2	120
Under reporting of prepaid revenue due to set off of revenue pertaining to Commission/Discount allowed to the distributors	8.2.3	120
Under reporting of revenue due to set off on account of “Impact of Market stock”	8.2.4	121
Non consideration of revenue from Infrastructure sharing from other telecom operators for GR/AGR	8.2.5	122
Short/Non-consideration of revenue from Forex gain in GR/AGR	8.2.6	123
Non/Short consideration of Interest Income for GR/AGR	8.2.7	124
Non consideration of Income from Investment for GR/AGR for payment of revenue Share	8.2.8	125
Non consideration of Miscellaneous income for GR/AGR	8.2.9	126
Non consideration of Income from profit on sale of fixed assets for payment of revenue share	8.2.10	127
Non Inclusion of Profit on revaluation of assets in GR	8.2.11	129
Short/non-payment of revenue share due irregular/excess deductions claimed in the AGR Statements	8.3	129
Irregular deduction of bad debts written off from GR to arrive at AGR	8.3.1	129
Excess Deductions claimed in ISP (IT) AGR	8.3.2	130
Interest on short/non-payment of LF and SUC	8.4	132
DoT’s response to the audit observations	8.5	132
<b>Chapter-IX: Verification of deduction claims in the Offices of the Controllers of Communications Accounts</b>		
Introduction	9.1	133
Audit Observations	9.2	133
Deductions allowed in absence of required proof	9.2.1	133
Ineligible deductions allowed from GR	9.2.2	134
Inadmissible deduction on account of Service Tax	9.2.3	135
Allowing deduction twice on same claim	9.2.4	136
Excess deduction allowed by Pr. CCA Andhra Pradesh while restricting deduction claims not supported by proof documents for TDS	9.2.5	137
Allowance of deduction on account of TDS despite non-submission of TDS certificate	9.2.6	137
Claims disallowed despite submission of proof documents	9.2.7	138

Description	Paragraph	Page
CsCA permitted irregular deductions on inter-divisional adjustments of ₹ 432.64 crore	9.2.8	139
Miscellaneous Observations	9.2.9	140
DoT's response	9.3	143
<b>Chapter-X: Assessment of Licence Fee and Spectrum Usage Charges</b>		
Introduction	10.1	145
Audit Findings	10.2	145
Under assessment of GR due to omission of revenues disclosed in reconciliation statements	10.2.1	145
Lack of coordination between LF and WPF Wing	10.2.2	146
Issue of demand notes based on Special Audit and provisional assessment without proper due diligence	10.2.3	147
Delay in submission of documents by service providers and absence of proper policy on time schedule leading to delay in verification of deductions by CsCA	10.2.4	148
Non assessment of LF of NLD, ILD and ISP for the year 2006-07 to 2009-10	10.2.5	149
Non recovery of LF and SUC on international roaming claimed by the Telecom Service Providers	10.2.6	149
Lack of appellate mechanism resulting in high number of litigations	10.2.7	151

<b>ANNEXURES</b>		
Annexure No.	Chapter No.	Page No.
1.01	Chapter I	157
3.01 to 3.24	Chapter III	158
4.01 to 4.10	Chapter IV	184
5.01 to 5.21	Chapter V	194
6.01 to 6.17	Chapter VI	220
7.01 to 7.21	Chapter VII	236
8.01 to 8.20	Chapter VIII	258
9.01 to 9.02	Chapter IX	278
10.01 to 10.03	Chapter X	280
	Glossary	285